

Environment Scrutiny Panel

Record of Meeting

Date: **11th February 2010**

Meeting Number: 19

Present	Deputy P Rondel (Chairman) (PR) Deputy D Wimberley (Vice Chairman) (DW) Connétable J Refault (JR) Deputy P Le Claire (PLC)
In attendance	M Haden , Scrutiny Officer M. Orbell, Scrutiny Officer

Ref Back	Agenda matter	Action
	1. Records of meetings The minutes of the meeting held on 28 th January 2010 were approved and signed.	MH
Item 2 28.01.10	2. Carbon Intensity Study The Panel was informed that a further meeting of representatives of all the energy suppliers was believed to be taking place the same day. Officers were asked to seek an update on progress. It was also agreed that the Panel should request a copy of the draft terms of reference as soon as these were available for study; there would be a need to approach the participants in the process to ensure that the terms of reference fully reflected what had been agreed between the parties.	MH
Item 2 28.01.10	3. Funding Waste Recycling: Ministerial response The Panel noted that the Minister's response would be slightly delayed as he was currently out of the Island.	
	4. Public Survey Tool It was noted that the Scrutiny Office had access to online survey software which had recently been used by the HSSH Panel with some success.	
	5. Questions in the States It was noted that officers had begun compiling a file of questions relevant to the Panel's remit, although the workload implications of collating details of oral questions were not yet clear.	MH/MO
Item 11 28.01.10	6. Bottled Water Deputy Le Claire volunteered to look into this matter to discover who had responsibility for ordering the bottled water used in the States building. It was believed that there had been a previous debate on supplies of bottled water to the States which could provide some relevant information.	PLC
Item 4 28.01.10	7. Panel Work Programme Members noted a draft programme of work for 2010. It was agreed that this was subject to amendment as a number of the items focused on major departmental initiatives that had already been subject to slippage	

<p>514/1(18)</p>	<p>in 2009. Members agreed that a mix of review work covering both departmental initiatives and matters of public interest spread over the year would be preferable. It was suggested that the public survey tool could be useful to assess public interest in different topics which might be considered for review. Deputy Le Claire would liaise with officers to draft a plan to bring back to the next meeting. Possible topics so far included:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Energy from Waste Plant emissions 2. Monitoring and regulation of water quality 3. Air quality 4. Disposal of food waste 5. The Comprehensive Spending Review 6. Green waste treatment 7. Disposal of bio-solids to land 8. Sustainable Transport Plan 9. Highway Maintenance and street-works legislation 10. Liquid Waste Strategy 11. Energy efficiency in States buildings <p>Members agreed that nos. 2 & 8 should be the next reviews carried out by the Panel.</p>	<p>PLC/MH/ MO</p>
	<p>8. Bus Contract Meeting – Feedback</p> <p>Members discussed matters raised in a meeting at the Transport and Technical Services Department on 1st February 2010. It was agreed that although the bus consultants' report offered a considerable improvement over previous proposals there was still some doubt whether some of the 'headline' matters (such as bus priority lanes) were achievable in practice. Members were somewhat disappointed that there was a lack of new vision in the report although the positive message about the ability to streamline and improve services was welcomed. Officers were asked to draft a letter to the Minister.</p> <p>During the discussion it was noted that advertising on buses could be a good source of revenue; officers confirmed that information on this subject had been requested from the department.</p>	<p>MH/MO</p> <p>MH/MO</p>
<p>Item 6 3.09.09</p>	<p>9. Sustainable Transport Plan (STP)</p> <p>Members noted that a meeting on the STP would go ahead at the Transport and Technical Services Department on 16th March at 2.00pm. Officers were asked to request a report on the consultation responses prior to the meeting.</p>	<p>MH/MO</p>
<p>Item 3 28.01.10 514/9(8)</p>	<p>10. Energy from Waste (EfW) Plant and Ramsar: Review of Planning Process</p> <p>The adviser had responded to the Panel with his views on the Minister for Transport and Technical Services' comments. The Panel agreed that it was preferable to await the response from the Minister for Planning and Environment before making any reply. It was noted that the Panel fully supported its adviser's findings and considered that the Minister for Transport and Technical Services had gone beyond the guidelines for ministerial responses in his criticism of the Panel's consultant, which it felt was unjustified. The Panel agreed that in the circumstances it would not be proper to post the Minister's response on the Scrutiny website until this matter had been resolved.</p> <p>Members also agreed that information received at the latest quarterly</p>	

	<p>briefing meeting with the Minister for Planning and Environment concerning the possible omission of a secondary gas analyser from the new EfW Plant should be followed up at the forthcoming briefing with the Minister for Transport and Technical Services. Officers were asked to include updates on this item and emissions from the La Collette chimney on the agenda for subsequent briefings.</p> <p>It was agreed that progress against the recommendations of the Ramsar report should be reviewed once a year had passed, so this matter should be included on the agenda for the Panel meeting in December 2010.</p> <p>Members were advised that a visit to the EfW Plant had been arranged for Tuesday 2nd March at 2.00pm.</p>	<p>MH/MO</p> <p>MH/MO</p> <p>MH/MO</p>
<p>Item 4 28.01.10 514/14(8)</p>	<p>11. Proposed review: Monitoring and Regulation of Water Quality in the Marine Environment</p> <p>The Panel considered a draft scoping document in respect of a possible review in this area; minor changes were agreed. Members felt that a review might assist in establishing benchmarks for water quality, the lack of which had been identified as a weakness during the Ramsar review. It was suggested that the review could be progressed with advice from locally-based experts provided that there was an opportunity for peer review before it was finalised. It was also felt that closer communication with the department could be beneficial. It was agreed that officers should approach the department to discuss the draft scoping and suggest a workshop meeting to be held at an early stage with the Minister and relevant officers to finalise terms of reference and establish guidelines for the review.</p>	<p>MH/MO</p> <p>MH/MO</p>
	<p>12. Chairmen's Committee</p> <p>Briefing notes from the Chairmen's Committee meeting of 28th January 2010 were circulated together with a memo dated 4th February 2010 and attached papers including:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Details of the timetable arising from the recent Scrutiny away-morning including dates for a review of the Scrutiny Code of Practice • A paper from the Comptroller and Auditor General on the reliability of evidence • A paper on Scrutiny meetings: public or private • A paper on the review of the roles of the Crown Officers • Comments on data protection issues • A request for comments on Scrutiny successes to be included in the Scrutiny Annual Report. <p>It was noted that the Vice Chairman would attend the next meeting of the Chairmen's Committee in the absence of the Chairman.</p>	
	<p>13. Ministerial Decisions</p> <p>Recent Ministerial Decisions pertinent to the Panel's remit were noted.</p>	
	<p>14. Questions to Ministers</p> <p>The arrangements for questions without notice to Ministers at the States sitting on 23rd February 2010 were noted.</p>	

	<p>15. Any Other Business</p> <p>It was agreed that an item would be included on the agenda for the next meeting concerning proposed questions for the next population census.</p>	<p>MH/MO</p>
	<p>16. Future meetings</p> <p>The Panel noted the following meetings:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 26th February 2010 - Quarterly Briefing with Minister for Transport and Technical Services • 2nd March 2010 - visit to EfW Plant • 4th March 2010 - next scheduled Panel meeting • 16th March 2010 - Sustainable Transport Plan meeting with Minister for Transport and Technical Services 	

Signed

P. J. Randall

Date:

4/3/10

Chairman Environment Panel